

3 2785 E. Desert Inn Road, Suite 180

Las Vegas, Nevada 89121

(702) 486-4120

STATE OF NEVADA DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND INDUSTRY FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS DIVISION

1179 Fairview Drive, Ste. 201 Carson City, Nevada 89701 (775) 687-5522

In	Re:

LIGHTHOUSE FINANCIAL GROUP OF NEVADA, INC.,

Petitioner.

DECLARATORY ORDER AND ADVISORY OPINION REGARDING THE INTEREST THAT CAN BE COLLECTED DURING REPAYMENT PLAN PERIOD PURSUANT TO NRS CHAPTER 604A

DECLARATORY ORDER AND ADVISORY OPINON REGARDING INTEREST THAT CAN BE COLLECTED DURING REPAYMENT PLAN PERIOD PURSUANT TO NRS CHAPTER 604A

Nevada, Department of Business and Industry, Financial Institutions Division (hereinafter "Division") hereby issues its Declaratory Order and Advisory Opinion regarding LIGHTHOUSE FINANCIAL GROUP OF NEVADA, INC.'s Petition for Advisory Opinion Pursuant to NRS 233B.120 and NAC 232.040.

JURISDICTION

- 1. Deferred deposit loan services, high interest loan services, title loan services and check cashing services in the State of Nevada are governed by chapter 604A of the Nevada Revised Statutes (NRS) and chapter 604A of the Nevada Administrative Code (NAC). The Division has primary jurisdiction for the licensing and regulation of persons operating and/or engaging in deferred deposit loan service, high interest loan service, title loan service and check cashing service activities or persons seeking to evade the application of NRS chapter 604A. See generally NRS 604A.020-.030, 604A.050-.060, 604A.080, 604A.095-.110, 604A.200, 604A.300, 604A.400, 604A.600 and 604A.710.
- 2. The Division also has primary jurisdiction for the licensing and regulation of persons engaging in the business of lending in the State of Nevada where such lending is

7

9

1

2

4

5

6

10

11 12

13

15

14

16

17 18

20 21

19

2223

24

25

2627

not governed by NRS chapter 604A. NRS 675.060. Pursuant to the authority vested by NRS chapters 604A, the Division hereby makes the following Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order.

STATEMENT OF FACT

- 3. Petitioner LIGHTHOUSE FINANCIAL is incorporated under the laws of the State of Nevada and has submitted this Petition by and through its attorney, Matthew T. Dushoff, Esq., of Kolesar & Leatham, Chtd.
- Petitioner is a company engaged in the business of lending pursuant to NRS
 Chapter 604A.
- 5. On November 4, 2009, Petitioner filed its Petition for an Advisory Opinion with the Division.
- 6. The Petitioner presents the following question for an advisory opinion: What interest can be charged by a title loan company under a repayment plan pursuant to NRS 604A.475?
- 7. Petitioner requests this advisory opinion to address concerns related to its ongoing bankruptcy case.

STATEMENT OF LAW

8. The rule regarding the issuing of Advisory Opinions by this agency is governed by NRS 233B.120, which reads as follows:

Each agency shall provide by regulation for the filing and prompt disposition of petitions for declaratory orders and advisory opinions as to the applicability of any statutory provision, agency regulation or decision of the agency. Declaratory orders disposing of petitions in such cases shall have the same status as agency decisions. A copy of the declaratory order or advisory opinion shall be mailed to the petitioner.

9. The Nevada Administrative Code (NAC) 323.040(1) establishes the procedure for filing a petition for declaratory order or advisory opinions as follows:

Except as otherwise provided in subsection 4, an interested person may petition the Director to issue a declaratory order or advisory opinion concerning the applicability of a statute, regulation or decision of the Department or any of its divisions.

 Upon receipt by the Director, the petition is then referred to the Commissioner for the Financial Institutions Division for determination. NAC 232.045.

STATUTORY BACKGROUND

- 11. The term "default" under NRS 604A.045 is defined as follows:
 - 1. "Default" means the failure of a customer to:
 - (a) Make a scheduled payment on a loan on or before the due date for the payment under the terms of a lawful loan agreement and any grace period that complies with the provisions of NRS 604A.210 or under the terms of any lawful extension or repayment plan relating to the loan and any grace period that complies with the provisions of NRS 604A.210; or
 - (b) Pay a loan in full on or before:
 - (1) The expiration of the initial loan period as set forth in a lawful loan agreement and any grace period that complies with the provisions of NRS 604A.210; or
 - (2) The due date of any lawful extension or repayment plan relating to the loan and any grace period that complies with the provisions of NRS 604A.210, provided that the due date of the extension or repayment plan does not violate the provisions of this chapter.
 - 2. A default occurs on the day immediately following the date of the customer's failure to perform as described in subsection 1.
- 12. Prior to the institution of any collection practices, a licensee is required to offer the borrower in default a repayment plan which meets the requirements of NRS 604A.475.

NRS 604A.475 Repayment plan.

- 1. Before a licensee attempts to collect the outstanding balance on a loan in default by commencing any civil action or process of alternative dispute resolution or repossessing a vehicle, the licensee shall offer the customer an opportunity to enter into a repayment plan. The licensee:
- (a) Is required to make the offer available to the customer for a period of at least 30 days after the date of default; and
- (b) Is not required to make such an offer more than once for each loan.

- 2. If the licensee intends to commence any civil action or process of alternative dispute resolution or repossess a vehicle in an effort to collect a defaulted loan, the licensee shall deliver to the customer, not later than 15 days after the date of default, or not later than 5 days after a check is not paid upon presentment or an electronic transfer of money fails, whichever is later, written notice of the opportunity to enter into a repayment plan. The written notice must:
- (a) Be in English, if the initial transaction was conducted in English, or in Spanish, if the initial transaction was conducted in Spanish;
- (b) State the date by which the customer must act to enter into a repayment plan;
- (c) Explain the procedures the customer must follow to enter into a repayment plan;
- (d) If the licensee requires the customer to make an initial payment to enter into a repayment plan, explain the requirement and state the amount of the initial payment and the date the initial payment must be made;
- (e) State that the customer has the opportunity to enter into a repayment plan with a term of at least 90 days after the date of default; and
 - (f) Include the following amounts:
- (1) The total of payments or the remaining balance on the original loan;
 - (2) Any payments made on the loan;
- (3) Any charges added to the loan amount allowed pursuant to the provisions of this chapter; and
- (4) The total amount due if the customer enters into a repayment plan.
- 3. Under the terms of any repayment plan pursuant to this section:
- (a) The customer must enter into the repayment plan not later than 30 days after the date of default, unless the licensee allows a longer period;
- (b) The licensee must allow the period for repayment to extend at least 90 days after the date of default, unless the customer agrees to a shorter term;
- (c) The licensee may require the customer to make an initial payment of not more than 20 percent of the total amount due under the terms of the repayment plan;
 - (d) For a deferred deposit loan:
- (1) The licensee may require a customer to provide, as security, one or more checks or written authorizations for an electronic transfer of money which equal the total amount due under the terms of the repayment plan;

- (2) The licensee shall, if the customer makes a payment in the amount of a check or written authorization taken as security for that payment, return to the customer the check or written authorization stamped "void" or destroy the check or written authorization; and
- (3) The licensee shall not charge any fee to the customer pursuant to NRS 604A.490 for a check which is provided as security during the repayment plan and which is not paid upon presentment if, in connection with that loan, the licensee has previously charged at least one such fee.
- 4. If the licensee and customer enter into a repayment plan pursuant to this section, the licensee shall honor the terms of the repayment plan, and the licensee shall not:
- (a) Except as otherwise provided by this chapter, charge any other amount to a customer, including, without limitation, any amount or charge payable directly or indirectly by the customer and imposed directly or indirectly by the licensee as an incident to or as a condition of entering into a repayment plan. Such an amount includes, without limitation:
- (1) Any interest, regardless of the name given to the interest, other than the interest charged pursuant to the original loan agreement at a rate which does not exceed the annual percentage rate charged during the term of the original loan agreement; or
- (2) Any origination fees, set-up fees, collection fees, transaction fees, negotiation fees, handling fees, processing fees, late fees, default fees or any other fees, regardless of the name given to the fee;
- (b) Except as otherwise provided in this section, accept any additional security or collateral from the customer to enter into the repayment plan;
- (c) Sell to the customer any insurance or require the customer to purchase insurance or any other goods or services to enter into the repayment plan;
- (d) Make any other loan to the customer, unless the customer is seeking multiple loans that do not exceed the limit set forth in NRS 604A.425;
- (e) During the term of the repayment plan, attempt to collect the outstanding balance by commencing any civil action or process of alternative dispute resolution or by repossessing a vehicle, unless the customer defaults on the repayment plan; or
- (f) Attempt to collect an amount that is greater than the amount owed under the terms of the repayment plan.
- 5. If the licensee and customer enter into a repayment plan pursuant to this section, the licensee shall:

- (a) Prepare a written agreement establishing the repayment plan; and
- (b) Give the customer a copy of the written agreement. The written agreement must:
 - (1) Be signed by the licensee and customer; and
- (2) Contain all of the terms of the repayment plan, including, without limitation, the total amount due under the terms of the repayment plan.
- 6. Each time a customer makes a payment pursuant to a repayment plan, the licensee shall give to the customer a receipt with the following information:
 - (a) The name and address of the licensee;
- (b) The identification number assigned to the loan agreement or other information that identifies the loan;
 - (c) The date of the payment;
 - (d) The amount paid;
- (e) The balance due on the loan or, when the customer makes the final payment, a statement that the loan is paid in full; and
- (f) If more than one loan made by the licensee to the customer was outstanding at the time the payment was made, a statement indicating to which loan the payment was applied.
- 7. If the customer defaults on the repayment plan, the licensee may, to collect the outstanding balance, commence any civil action or process of alternative dispute resolution or repossess a vehicle as otherwise authorized pursuant to this chapter.
- Further, NRS 604A.485 details the amount that a licensee can charge after default on a loan.

NRS 604A.485 Limitations on amounts licensee may collect after default.

- 1. If a customer defaults on a loan or on any extension or repayment plan relating to the loan, whichever is later, the licensee may collect only the following amounts from the customer, less all payments made before and after default:
 - (a) The unpaid principal amount of the loan.
- (b) The unpaid interest, if any, accrued before the default at the annual percentage rate set forth in the disclosure statement required by the Truth in Lending Act and Regulation Z that is provided to the customer. If there is an extension, in writing and signed by the customer, relating to the loan, the licensee may charge and collect interest pursuant to this paragraph for a period not to exceed 60 days after the expiration of the initial loan period, unless otherwise allowed by NRS 604A.480.

- (c) The interest accrued after the expiration of the initial loan period or after any extension or repayment plan that is allowed pursuant to this chapter, whichever is later, at an annual percentage rate not to exceed the prime rate at the largest bank in Nevada, as ascertained by the Commissioner, on January 1 or July 1, as the case may be, immediately preceding the expiration of the initial loan period, plus 10 percent. The licensee may charge and collect interest pursuant to this paragraph for a period not to exceed 90 days. After that period, the licensee shall not charge or collect any interest on the loan.
- (d) Any fees allowed pursuant to NRS 604A.490 for a check that is not paid upon presentment or an electronic transfer of money that fails because the account of the customer contains insufficient funds or has been closed.
- -- The sum of all amounts collected pursuant to paragraphs (b), (c) and (d) must not exceed the principal amount of the loan.
- 2. Except for the interest and fees permitted pursuant to subsection 1 and any other charges expressly permitted pursuant to NRS 604A.430, 604A.445 and 604A.475, the licensee shall not charge any other amount to a customer, including, without limitation, any amount or charge payable directly or indirectly by the customer and imposed directly or indirectly by the licensee as an incident to or as a condition of the extension of the period for the payment of the loan or the extension of credit. Such prohibited amounts include, without limitation:
- (a) Any interest, other than the interest charged pursuant to subsection 1, regardless of the name given to the interest; or
- (b) Any origination fees, set-up fees, collection fees, transaction fees, negotiation fees, handling fees, processing fees, late fees, default fees or any other fees, regardless of the name given to the fee.

QUESTION PRESENTED

- 14. The Petitioner presents the following question for an advisory opinion: What interest can be charged by a title loan company under a repayment plan pursuant to NRS 604A.475.
- 15. As part of the request, Petitioner argues that the amount of interest should be the contract rate of interest to accrue throughout the repayment plan period.
- 16. As support for this argument, Petitioner states that NRS 604A.475(4)(a)(1) permits that the charging of the rate of interest in the original loan contract and that the

restrictions on the amount to be collected after default under NRS 604A.485 are only applicable after the borrower has defaulted on the repayment plan and is not part of the repayment plan itself.

17.

LEGAL ANALYSIS

- 18. While this issue has been the source of ongoing confusion and dispute, this is the first time the Division has had an opportunity to address it as an Advisory Opinion or Declaratory Order.
- 19. The answer to this question requires a review of the rules of statutory construction.
- 20. The statutory scheme for the interest on repayment plans relies upon the interpretation of the three statutes stated above.
- 21. NRS Chapter 604A is a statute which regulates deferred deposit loan services, high interest loan services, title loan services and check cashing services. These loans, often referred to as "payday loans" are generally for short periods of time at high rates of interest.
- 22. As stated above, the term default means the failure to make any scheduled payment or payment in full by the due date on the initial loan or any extension or repayment plan on that loan. NRS 604A.045.
- 23. Before a licensee can make any attempt to collect on a loan which is in default, the licensee must offer a repayment plan pursuant to NRS 604A.675.
- 24. The repayment plan was established to give the borrower an opportunity to repay the loan and avoid having the loan go into collection. (Hearing on A.B. 384 Before the Senate Committee on Commerce and Labor, 2005 Legis., 73rd Sess. 20-21 (May 6, 2005)).
- 25. The terms of the repayment plan require that the time period for repayment of the loan be at least 90 days but there is no maximum time limit. NRS 604A.475(3)(b).

- 26. NRS 604A.475(4)(a)(1) excludes the charging of interest during the repayment plan period "other than the interest **charged** pursuant to the original loan agreement at a rate which does not exceed the annual percentage rate charged during the term of the original loan agreement..." (Id.)(Emphasis added).
- 27. While this statute addresses the issue, the meaning is unclear. As Petitioner argues, the statute can be interpreted to mean that the repayment plan may include interest at the contract rate through the repayment plan period.
- 28. However, the statute is susceptible to another interpretation. Because the statute specifically limits the time period to "during the term of the original loan agreement," the statute can be read to only permit the charging of the contract interest rate for that period specified in the original contract and for no longer.
- 29. As a further factor to consider, if the borrower defaults on the original loan or the repayment plan, the licensee's remedies are limited to those stated in NRS 604A.485. If the borrower defaults, the licensee is only entitled to collect the unpaid principle of the initial loan, the unpaid interest prior to default, and interest for 90 days after default in an amount not to exceed the prime rate of interest of the largest bank in the State of Nevada plus ten percent. NRS 604A.485(1).
- 30. The total amount of fees and interest a licensee can collect after default is capped and cannot exceed the total amount of the principle of the initial loan. (*Id.*)
- 31. Petitioner argues that because this provision is only effective after "a customer defaults on a loan or on any extension or repayment plan relating to the loan, whichever is later," that the restrictions only apply after the customer has defaulted on the repayment plan and not during the repayment plan period. For the purposes of this Advisory Opinion, the Division will not dispute that assertion.
- 32. Petitioner requests that the Division impose an interpretation that a licensee may collect the contract rate of interest throughout the repayment plan period.

33. However, such an interpretation would lead to a result which is both contradictory to the stated intent of the legislature in enacting NRS Chapter 604A and would lead to an absurd result.

- 34. For instance, a borrower unable to fulfill his contract would have the choice between paying substantially less by remaining in default or continue to be obligated to pay the contracted interest rate in a repayment plan, after it is evident that the borrower cannot meet the obligations of the original contact.
- 35. As the Nevada Supreme Court stated in *Sheriff, Clark County v. Burcham*, 198 P.3d 326, 329 (Nev.,2008), "[W]e only look beyond the plain language of the statute if that language is ambiguous or its plain meaning clearly was not intended. Therefore, where the legislative intent is clear, we must effectuate that intent. Additionally, statutory construction should always avoid an absurd result." (Footnotes and quotations omitted).
- 36. Further, the Court stated in *V* and *S Ry. LLC v. White Pine County*, 211 P.3d 879, 882 (Nev.,2009), "In Nevada, "words in a statute should be given their plain meaning unless this violates the spirit of the act." (*Id citing McKay v. Bd. of Supervisors*, 102 Nev. 644, 648, 730 P.2d 438, 441 (1986)).
- 37. In the present case, the Division is presented with both an ambiguous statute and a potentially absurd result. Consequently, the Division will look to the legislative history of NRS 604A.475.
- 38. Originally enacted in 2005, this provision was part of Assembly Bill 384. The issue of interest during the repayment plan period was specifically addressed before the Senate Committee on Commerce and Labor. Assemblywoman Barbara E. Buckley, the sponsor of the bill, stated, "It was our intention that the original contract be in effect and unchanged during the repayment period. If the customer defaults on the repayment plan, the lender may go to court." (Hearing on A.B. 384 before the Senate Committee on Commerce and Labor, 2005 Leg., 73rd Sess. 5 (May 9, 2005)). When asked specifically if "the originally-contracted interest continues to accrue during the repayment period,"

Assemblywoman Buckley stated, "The intention was that it would not." (Id.)(Emphasis added).

- 39. While NRS 604A.475(4)(a)(1) may appear to permit the exact opposite of the intent expressed at the hearing, a close reading of the statute indicates otherwise.
- 40. As the Court stated in *V* and *S* Ry. LLC v. White Pine County, supra, the interpretation of the statute must give meaning to each word and phrase.

A statute must be construed as to "'give meaning to all of [its] parts and language, and this court will read each sentence, phrase, and word to render it meaningful within the context of the purpose of the legislation.' "Further, a statute should not be read in a manner that renders a part of a statute meaningless or produces an absurd or unreasonable result. (*Id.*) (Citations omitted)(quotations included).

- 41. NRS 604A.475(4)(a)(1) states two requirements regarding the interest to be charged during the repayment period. First, it permits the amount of interest "charged pursuant to the original loan agreement." (Emphasis added).
- 42. Second, the interest amount charged must be "at a rate which does not exceed the annual percentage rate charged during the term of the original loan agreement."
- 43. The Legislature specifically limited the total amount of interest which the licensee may collect during the repayment plan period only to the amount that it "charged" during the original loan agreement.
- 44. Thus, the statute only permits the licensee to collect that amount of interest which it could have collected during the time period of the original loan agreement.
- 45. Because the time frame for the repayment period may be longer or shorter, depending on the contract, the Legislature capped the rate at which that interest could be collected so that it would not exceed the annual percentage rate stated in the original loan agreement.

46. The Petitioner's interpretation of the statute would give meaning to the second part of the sentence which only states that a licensee could charge the contract rate of interest during the repayment period. But this interpretation would render meaningless the remaining provisions regarding the amount of interest "charged" and the time period of the original contract.

47. In reviewing the legislative history regarding the enactment of NRS Chapter 604A, it is clear the spirit of the legislation was to prevent the "debt treadmill, " where borrowers are caught in an endless cycle of increasing debt. Assemblywoman Buckley described the debt treadmill problem:

The debt treadmill begins when a customer takes out their first payday loan. A loan interest rate can range from 150 to 1,100 percent annually. It is not uncommon among those who seek assistance from credit counseling agencies and legal aid agencies to take out a second loan to pay the first and a third one to pay the second. I have met a dozen consumers who have taken out a dozen loans just to pay the interest on the other loans.

(Hearing on A.B. 384 Before the Senate Committee on Commerce and Labor, 2005 Legis., 73rd Sess. 7 (May 6, 2005)).

48. Also, the law was enacted to prevent egregious penalties if a borrower defaults. As Assemblywoman Buckley explained:

It is not uncommon for consumers to eventually fall off the debt treadmill and into the wage-garnishment machine where their meager earnings are quickly siphoned off by judgments that can double and triple the amount of the loan and which completely ignore any and all payments made. Because of the volume of lawsuits in small claims courts and justice courts, many judgments are by default and are rubber-stamped by the courts which are unable to keep up regardless of the legality or amount sought.

49. Consequently, if a repayment plan were to accrue interest at the contract rate, the borrower may be caught in a further cycle of debt which would create a substantially

| (ld.)

greater burden than simply defaulting on the loan itself. This result is evident in neither the letter nor the spirit of the law.

14 15

17

18

20

22

24

25

26

27

28

CONCLUSION

- 50. Therefore, the Division's opinion is that a repayment plan can only collect that amount of interest that it could have collected during the term of the original loan agreement at a rate not to exceed the rate stated in the original loan agreement.
 - 51. No interest accrues during the time the borrower is under a repayment plan.
- 52. If the borrower defaults on the repayment plan, the licensee may pursue legal collection practices and the borrower's remaining principle may accrue interest at the rate stated in NRS 604A.485(1)(c).
- The Division is aware that licensees are permitted to extend the loans for 53. additional periods. However, the interest which can be obtained is only that which could have been received from the original loan under the terms and time frame of the original loan agreement without any extensions.
- As an example from a loan issued by Petitioner, Petitioner made a title loan in 54. the principle amount of \$15,000.00. The finance charge for the loan is listed as \$1,935.00 to be paid in full at the end of 30 days, which equates to an annual percentage rate of 156.95%. Therefore, the total amount of payment for the loan was \$16,935.00
- If the borrower defaulted on the loan and Petitioner offers a repayment plan, 55. the most interest that Petitioner may charge is the amount of finance charges listed in the contract, or \$1,935.00.
- This is true even if the borrower has made payments toward the interest prior 56. to default. Of course, payments made toward the principle must be reduced accordingly.

- 57. This \$1,935.00 amount is interest and cannot be charged in a repayment plan at an annual rate greater than 156.95%, the rate stated in the original loan agreement. No other interest rate is permitted during the repayment plan period.
- 58. Previously, the Division had cited licensees for charging fees and interest in excess of the limitations pursuant to NRS 604A.485. Although this provided a cap on the borrower's obligation, it did not conform to the Legislative intent to prevent any further interest from accruing during the repayment plan period.
- 59. While those licensees may have been equally in violation based upon this Declaratory Order and Advisory Opinion, the Division will not view any prior violations regarding the charging of interest during the repayment plan period as a repeat violation.
- 60. Because this issue has been a source of controversy, the Division will provide this opinion on its website, located at www.fid.state.nv.us, so it may be used as a source of reference in future examinations.

DATED this 1st day of December, 2009.

STATE OF NEVADA
DEPARTMENT OF BUSINESS AND INDUSTRY,
FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS DIVISION

By:

GEORGE E. BURNS, Commissioner